

Congress of the United States House of Representatives Washington, DC 20515

The Honorable Eric Adams Mayor of New York City City Hall New York, NY 10007

April 5, 2024

Dear Mayor Adams:

We write to renew our request that the City of New York, after more than 20 years, fully disclose what the Giuliani Administration knew about the harmful impacts of the toxins released in the 9/11 attacks. It is long past time for the City to comply fully with disclosing the requested records to the public. This letter is in follow up to correspondence we sent to then-Mayor DeBlasio on September 20, 2021, and to you on May 12, 2022 and February 16, 2023. We have enclosed copies of those letters and your responses.

More than 22 years have passed since the terrorist attacks of September 11th, 2001, but the City still refuses to be transparent about what the Giuliani Administration knew about the danger of the toxins that covered lower Manhattan and Western Brooklyn at the same time it was publicly stating that it was safe for the public to return to the area surrounding Ground Zero. To this day, thousands of New Yorkers and countless first responders continue to deal with the health impacts of the toxins that were in the air at that time. The City dishonors these men and women, many now dead, by refusing to open its 9/11 files to the public.

Instead of simply releasing the requested documents, the City continues to publicly contradict itself. In 2001, while then-Mayor Giuliani's administration publicly stated that the air was safe to breathe, they were privately predicting 10,000 liability claims for injuries from toxic exposures. An October 2001 memorandum to Deputy Mayor Robert Harding said that the city was facing up to 10,000 liability claims related to 9/11, "including toxic tort cases that might arise in the next few decades." ¹

Today, the City of New York's lawyers are aware that there is damaging information contained in the City's files. In February of 2024, a spokeswoman from your office was quoted saying, "we are aware of requests to produce city documents on the aftermath of the attacks, which would

¹¹ Anthony DePalma, *Ground Zero Illnesses Clouding Giuliani's Legacy*, the New York Times, May 14, 2007, https://www.nytimes.com/2007/05/14/nyregion/14giuliani.html

require extensive legal review to identify privileged material and liability risk, and are exploring ways to determine the cost of such a review."²

Additionally, you have also indicated that your team is aware of records about what the Giuliani administration knew about air quality following the 9/11 attacks. When asked about that issue in a March 2024 press conference, you responded, "in regards to the 9/11 report, corp counsel and the entire team, they're going to make that determination because that didn't take place under this administration. They're going to make that determination on what's going to be released and what's not."³

Despite these statements, the City of New York's Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) and Office of Emergency Management (OEM) denied a September 2023 Freedom of Information Law (FOIL) request from 911 Health Watch. Absurdly, the FOIL request and appeal was denied on the grounds that "no responsive records were found."⁴ It is difficult to believe that there is not a single record in DEP and OEM's files from the last 22 years addressing the environmental catastrophe that resulted from the largest attack on American soil.

Under FOIL, the City's "records are presumptively open to public inspection, without regard to need or purpose of the applicant." <u>Beechwood Restorative Care Ctr. v. Signor</u>, 5 N.Y.3d 435, 440–41, 842 N.E.2d 466, 469 (2005). Additionally, New York Courts have long held that "all government records are presumptively open for public inspection unless specifically exempted from disclosure as provided in the Public Officers Law Sec. 87(2)." <u>Fappiano v. New York City</u> Police Dep't, 95 N.Y.2d 738, 746, 747 N.E.2d 1286, 1289 (2001)

While New York law provides for certain exemptions for government documents subject to FOIL, the City has cited no specific exemption enabling it to withhold the documents. In response to our previous letters, the City has cited concerns about the potential liability that these documents could create. In the March 2023 response to our February 2023 letter, the City noted it seeks "federal legislation" to make the disclosure "economically and legally feasible," by guaranteeing additional protections from lawsuits.⁵ However, liability is not an allowable exception under FOIL to keep these documents from the public.

We are continuing our call for the City to provide full transparency on what the Giuliani administration knew about the health risks at Ground Zero. Specifically, we respectfully request the City to:

² Thomas Tracy, *Mayor Adams won't release 9/11 toxin reports until NYC's liability risk determined*, New York Daily News, February 26th, 2024, https://www.nydailynews.com/2024/02/26/mayor-adams-wont-release-9-11-toxin-reports-until-nycs-liability-risk-determined/

³ *Transcript: Mayor Adams Holds In-Person Media Availability*, the Official Website of the City of New York, March 5, 2024, https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/166-24/transcript-mayor-adams-holds-in-person-media-availability

⁴ Effort to Get New York City to Release 9/11 Documents, 9/11 Health Watch,

https://www.911healthwatch.org/effort-to-get-new-york-city-to-release-9-11-documents/

⁵ Mayor Eric Adams, Letter to Representative Jerrold Nadler and Representative Dan Goldman, March 22, 2023, https://www.911healthwatch.org/files/2023-0322-NYC-Response-_-Reps.-Nadler-Goldman-911-records.pdf

- 1. Release the full copy of the memorandum from the Giuliani administration from Deputy Mayor Robert M. Harding from October 2001 and any correspondence that led to his writing and drafting of this memo.
- 2. Release any records, communications, or memorandums from the New York City Departments of Health and/or Environmental Protection that address the scope and toxicity of the WTC plume and dust, and the exposures New Yorkers experienced.
- 3. Release any internal notes or memorandums regarding the Department of Education's decision to direct kids and teachers back into schools in the frozen zone below Houston street.
- 4. Respond in writing to the following questions: regarding the decision to move kids and teachers back into schools in the frozen zone below Houston Street -- what were the deliberations in the Department of Education at the time? What testing was done to determine the safety of the schools?

Your Administration has the opportunity to provide justice to its residents whose health has suffered from the dangerous air quality in Manhattan following the 9/11 attacks. If the City Department of Investigations were to conduct a search for and release the aforementioned documents, the City could prove its commitment to transparency and accountability. Continuing to keep these records in the dark is not an option.

In other regards, we believe this administration has been a tremendous partner to the New York Congressional delegation in supporting 9/11 victims, survivors, and their families. Just this past year, your administration supported our work to provide additional funding for the World Trade Center Health Program and expand the program to Pentagon and Shanksville crash site first responders. We are thankful for your partnership in those efforts. However, the City can and must do more.

We look forward to your response.

Sincerely,

Jenoth Hadlen

JERROLD NADLER Member of Congress

DAN GOLDMAN Member of Congress

Enclosures: 5

Congress of the United States Washington, DC 20510

September 20, 2021

Dear Mayor de Blasio:

Given the recent 20th Anniversary of the 9/11 attacks, we call on you and your administration to open the City's files on the aftermath of the attacks to help provide injured and ill 9/11 responders, survivors, and their families a better understanding of what the City knew at the time about the likely scope of the health crisis and when they knew it.

The time has come for a full accounting of the history of 9/11. President Biden's ongoing review and declassification of documents related to the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia's possible involvement in the 9/11 attacks were a critical first step in this accounting. Providing full transparency on what the government knew about the health risks at Ground Zero and how they potentially covered up that information will finally provide transparency to a too-often overlooked aspect of the attack's history.

Throughout our two decades of work with the 9/11 community to guarantee their health care and compensation, we have faced resistance from many in the federal government – namely to admitting that the toxins released in the attacks and during cleanup posed a serious and ongoing health hazard to those on the pile and in the vicinity. Those health risks, about which we immediately warned the government, have now caused enormous harm to thousands of responders and survivors. Many of them are now living with – and too many are dying from – 9/11 related health conditions caused by exposure to those toxins 20 years ago.

In 2003, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) released a report on how they responded to 9/11.¹ This report outlined what the federal government knew about the extent of the problem and the clear health threat, after the EPA Administrator Christie Todd Whitman had repeatedly said that the "air was safe to breathe." However, we have yet to see a full accounting of what then-Mayor Giuliani and his administration knew at the time.

While previous reports have hinted at what the Giuliani administration knew about the health risks,² it is time for a complete accounting of this history. If it is true that they knew that thousands of responders and community members would face tremendous long-term health impacts, the administration unnecessarily delayed the effort to provide health care to the thousands of responders and survivors exposed in the aftermath on the pile and in schools, offices, and homes around the area.

¹ Office of Inspector General, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Report #2003-P-00012, *Report: EPA's Response to the World Trade Center Collapse: Challenges, Successes, and Areas for Improvement* (Aug. 21, 2003), <u>https://www.epa.gov/office-inspector-general/report-epas-response-world-trade-center-collapse-challenges-successes-and</u>.

² Anthony DePalma, *Ground Zero Illnesses Clouding Giuliani's Legacy*, N.Y. Times (May 14, 2007), <u>https://www.nytimes.com/2007/05/14/nyregion/14giuliani.html</u>.

It is imperative that we learn from the mistakes made in the aftermath of the attacks and ensure that in any future disasters, we are better prepared to identify and deal with potential long-term health risks.

We urge you to have the City of New York review its files and, in the interest of transparency, fully release any information it has on the what the City knew about the hazards faced by 9/11 responders and survivors who lived, worked, and went to school in the covered disaster zone.

More specifically, we ask that the City release any documents related to 9/11 that are in its files or emails from the period of September 11, 2001 through the spring of 2002. While some documents may have been disclosed in past litigation, we do not believe this represents the entirety of the City's files and demand a complete release.

Two decades later, a full review remains pressing. Elected officials who made life and death decisions, and who failed to disclose vital information owe accountability to the public. Finally, it is critical that lessons be learned to protect responders and the public in any future disaster.

Carolyn B. Malory

Carolyn B. Maloney

Jewold Hadlen

Jerrold Nadler

Congress of the United States

Washington, DC 20510

May 12, 2022

The Honorable Eric Adams Mayor of New York City City Hall New York, NY 10007

Dear Mayor Adams:

Last year, shortly after the 20th Anniversary of the 9/11 attacks, we wrote to then-Mayor DeBlasio, on September 20th, 2021, asking that he and his administration open the City's files on the aftermath of the attacks to help provide injured and ill 9/11 responders, survivors, and their families a better understanding of what the City government knew at the time about the likely scope of the health crisis and when they knew it. A copy of our letter is enclosed.

As we stated in our letter at the time, "The time has come for a full accounting of the history of 9/11. The ongoing review and declassification of documents related to the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia's possible involvement in the 9/11 attacks ordered by President Biden was a critical first step in this accounting. Providing full transparency on what the government knew about the health risks at Ground Zero and how they potentially covered up that information will finally provide transparency to a too-often overlooked aspect of the attack's history."

"Throughout our two decades of work with the 9/11 community to guarantee their health care and compensation, we have faced resistance from many in the federal government – namely to admitting that the toxins released in the attacks and during cleanup posed a serious and ongoing health hazard to those on the pile and in the vicinity. Those health risks, about which we immediately warned the government, have now caused enormous harm to thousands of responders and survivors. Many of them are now living with – and too many are dying from – 9/11 related health conditions caused by exposure to those toxins 20 years ago."

"In 2003, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) released a report on how they responded to 9/11.¹ This report outlined what the federal government knew about the extent of the problem and the clear health threat, after the EPA Administrator Christie Todd Whitman had repeatedly said that the 'air was safe to breathe.' However, we have yet to see a full accounting of what then-Mayor Giuliani and his administration knew at the time."

While this report was released 20 years ago, 9/11 responders, survivors, and their families continue to deal with the health impacts of toxin exposure everyday of their lives. As we urged former Mayor DeBlasio last year, we urge you to have the City review its files and, in the interest of transparency, fully release any information it has on the what the City knew about the

¹ Office of Inspector General, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Report #2003-P-00012, *Report: EPA's Response to the World Trade Center Collapse: Challenges, Successes, and Areas for Improvement* (Aug. 21, 2003), <u>https://www.epa.gov/office-inspector-general/report-epas-response-world-trade-center-collapse-challenges-successes-and</u>.

hazards faced by 9/11 responders and survivors who lived, worked, and went to school in the covered disaster zone.

More specifically, we urge the City to release any documents related to 9/11 that are in its files or emails from the period of September 11, 2001 through the spring of 2002. While some documents may have been disclosed in past litigation, we do not believe this represents the entirety of the City's files and demand a complete release.

We hope that before this coming 9/11 Anniversary, the City will release whatever documents it may have so that we can finally get a full accounting on what was known.

Thank you for your attention to this issue and we look forward to hearing from you and your administration.

Carolyn B. Malory

Carolyn B. Maloney

Jewold Hadlen

Jerrold Nadler



The City of New York Office of the Mayor New York, N.Y. 10007

July 6, 2022

The Honorable Carolyn Maloney Congresswoman U.S. House of Representatives 2308 Rayburn House Office Building Washington, DC 20515 The Honorable Jerrold Nadler Congressman U.S. House of Representatives 2132 Rayburn House Office Building Washington, DC, 20515

Dear Congresswoman Maloney and Congressman Nadler:

Thank you for your letter, dated May 12, 2022, and for providing the previous letter to Mayor de Blasio, concerning documents related to September 11th and Ground Zero. I, like all New Yorkers, remember the day our city was forever changed. As a NYPD lieutenant securing the World Trade Center on 9/11, I witnessed firsthand the ground smoldering, the demolished buildings, and the horror of that day. I also remember the many lives lost and the countless heroes who put themselves in harm's way that day and the many days that followed. We all know someone who died that day, and we hold their memories close to our hearts. I also know the collective grief shared by the responders, survivors, and the families of those that died and have suffered along with all New Yorkers who remember that horrible day.

September 11, 2001 was devasting to responders, survivors, and their families. As I stood with them then, I stand with them now, as we remember those that died in the attacks. I also stand with those that suffer from illnesses they have been forced to endure because of their proximity to Ground Zero. I commend Congress for creating the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund, the James Zadroga 9/11 Health and Compensation Act, and the subsequent reauthorizations to ensure anyone who suffered harm or was killed as a result of 9/11 or the debris removal efforts at Ground Zero are compensated. The Victim Compensation Fund has provided critical relief to so many and I thank Congress for working to provide financial security to the responders, survivors, and their families.

I also applaud Congress for acting after 9/11 by providing FEMA funding to establish the World Trade Center Captive Insurance Company, which insured New York City and its contractors for claims arising from debris removal at the World Trade Center.

My administration is deeply committed to ensuring that the responders, survivors, and their families are supported. As Chair of the House Oversight and Reform Committee and Chair of the House Judiciary Committee, Congresswoman Maloney and Congressman Nadler continue to lead advocacy on highlighting the emerging needs of responders, survivors, and their families for the City of New York. To that end, I would like to invite your offices to a meeting with my team, so we can determine the best path forward. We sincerely appreciate your concerns and your interest in the continued support of New Yorkers and those affected by the 9/11 attacks. I look forward to ongoing collaboration.

Eric Adams

Mayor

Congress of the United States Washington, DC 20515

The Honorable Eric Adams Mayor of New York City City Hall New York, NY 10007

February 16, 2023

Dear Mayor Adams:

We are writing to you again to renew the request that the City of New York finally, after more than 20 years, fully disclose what the Giuliani Administration knew about the harmful impacts of the toxins released in the 9/11 attacks, the subsequent cleanup, and when it knew this information.

This letter is to follow up on letters sent to then-Mayor DeBlasio on September 20, 2021, and to you on May 12, 2022, asking the City to finally open its files on the aftermath of the attacks— and help provide injured and ill 9/11 responders, survivors, and their families a better understanding of the origins of what they have faced.

We have enclosed copies of those letters and your response on July 6, 2022.

It is long past time for full disclosure of the City's records. While more than 20 years have passed, we still do not know the full impact of that day and the aftermath on the health of thousands of New Yorkers, and the full extent of what the City knew at the time.

For years, the City's failure to disclose documents regarding the harmful impacts of the toxins released in the 9/11 attack has directly harmed September 11th responders, recovery workers, residents, and survivors. These residents and survivors include young people who were in schools and daycares in downtown Manhattan on 9/11 and during clean-up that continue to experience adverse health effects at high rates.

Information in the City's records pertaining to the earliest analyses of the toxins, dust, and fumes blanketing lower Manhattan and Brooklyn will likely inform and advance medical research conducted on behalf of those struggling with 9/11 illnesses, including those who were children at the time of the attacks.

While we understand that the City is concerned about its liability, releasing the records will likely help to save lives.

To better address the public health impact of the attacks on children, Congress acted in December to authorize the creation by the World Trade Center Health Program of a new research cohort of the nearly 35,000 people who were children on 9/11 and were brought back into lower Manhattan and western Brooklyn to live and go to school or daycare in the months after the attacks while the wreckage was still smoldering.

At the same time, Congress had to authorize an additional \$1 billion to the World Trade Center Health Program because of increasing costs caused by rising enrollment and increasing diagnoses of multiple conditions—especially cancers—to address a \$3 billion-dollar projected shortfall in the program.

Based on *New York Times* reporting (*"Ground Zero Illnesses Clouding Giuliani's Legacy"* May 14, 2007), we know that while then-Mayor Giuliani's administration was saying publicly that the air was safe to breathe, they were privately predicting 10,000 liability claims for injuries from toxic exposures.

"Whatever they were saying publicly about the safety of the air, Mr. Giuliani and his staff were privately worried. A memo to Deputy Mayor Robert M. Harding from his assistant in early October said that the city faced as many as 10,000 liability claims connected to 9/11, "including toxic tort cases that might arise in the next few decades." ¹

But that is the extent of what we know.

That's because, following your July 6, 2022 reply to our letter, our staff met with the City Corporation Counsel staff. Despite the benefits that releasing the records could mean for informing and advancing medical research conducted on behalf of those struggling with 9/11 illnesses, Corporation Counsel attorneys clearly stated they have a strong incentive to keep any 9/11 aftermath documents privileged because otherwise, the city would be liable for those claims.

In addition to records pertaining to the earliest analyses of the toxins, dust, and fumes blanketing lower Manhattan and Brooklyn, we request transparency on what the Giuliani administration knew about the health risks at Ground Zero and how they potentially covered up that information to finally provide transparency to a too-often overlooked aspect of the attack's history.

We are joined in this call be a host of community-based organizations and are attaching five letters sent to you in September of 2022.

We hope and believe that you will direct the City's Department of Investigations to conduct a thorough search of the available records from the then-Mayor's office, the City Departments of Health, Education, Police, Fire, Design and Construction and Emergency Management to name the most likely agencies that need their files reviewed.

¹ Anthony DePalma, *Ground Zero Illnesses Clouding Giuliani's Legacy*, N.Y. Times (May 14, 2007), https://www.nytimes.com/2007/05/14/nyregion/14giuliani.html

We specifically believe New Yorkers need to see the following:

1. Release of the full copy of the memo from the Giuliani administration from Deputy Mayor Robert M. Harding from October 2001 and any correspondence that led to his writing and drafting of this memo.

2. Any internal notes or memos regarding the Department of Education's decision to move kids and teachers back into schools in the frozen zone below Houston. We know that there were parents who expressed strong concerns and even protested this move. What were the deliberations in the DOE? What testing was done to determine the safety of the schools?

3. Any records, communications, or memos from the New York City Departments of Health and the Environmental Protection that address the scope and toxicity of the WTC plume and the dust, and the exposures New Yorkers experienced.

We have faith that you will not allow this to continue and that you will order the City's agencies to fully disclose what the Giuliani administration knew about the toxins at Ground Zero while they were saying it was safe for New Yorkers to return. We look forward to receiving your response.

Jewold Hadlen

Jerrold Nadler Member of Congress

Dan Goldman Member of Congress



The City of New York Office of the Mayor New York, N.Y. 10007

March 22, 2023

The Honorable Jerrold Nadler United States House of Representatives 2132 Rayburn House Office Building Washington, DC 20515 The Honorable Dan Goldman United States House of Representatives 245 Cannon House Office Building Washington, DC 20515

Dear Representative Nadler and Representative Goldman:

Thank you for your letter, dated February 16, 2023. As someone who was a first responder on September 11th, I am reminded of the horror and heartache that so many families and survivors endured not only on that terrible day more than 20 years ago but also in the days since. I take my responsibility as a first responder, New Yorker, and now Mayor seriously – to protect New Yorkers and make whole, to the best of my ability, the victims, responders, families, and survivors who have endured so much. They must always know that New York City has their back.

In your letter, you state that research is needed into the illnesses regarding the toxins in and around Ground Zero. After September 11th, there were concerns about potentially long-term health effects from the disaster, especially from the toxins people inhaled from the dust cloud and the psychological impact of the events. To address these concerns, in November 2001, the New York City Department of Health and Human Services (NYC DOHMH) helped create a registry devoted to handling September 11th -related health effects.¹ Their main goals were to:

- Track the short and long-term health of people exposed to the September 11th disaster in NYC and its aftermath, including responders and area residents, workers, and children;
- Document the physical and mental health impact of the September 11th disaster and gaps in care;
- Investigate cancers and mortality among those who were exposed to the September 11th disaster;
- Inform September 11th-related health care; and
- Help enrollees and others find services for their September 11th health-related conditions.

In addition, since the day of the attacks, New York City as well as federal, state, and local authorities, researchers, and health professionals, have published reports, articles, and data regarding the measured toxins released in the September 11th attacks, and their current and long-term effects on responders, recovery workers, residents, and others who were exposed to them.

¹ <u>https://www.nyc.gov/site/911health/about/wtc-health-registry.page</u>

Lessons learned from a disaster can save lives and reduce injuries in future disasters, and we are and have been committed to doing just that. Below is small, non-comprehensive sample of the publicly available data and research regarding the toxins and health effects of the September 11th attacks:

- NYC DOHMH's September 11th Health <u>website</u>, which maintains a comprehensive list of September 11th -related research studies and findings;
- Reports from the <u>WTC Medical Working Group</u>, which reviewed research findings on the health effects of WTC exposure;
- U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's Response to the WTC Collapse: Challenges, Successes & Areas for Improvement;
- U.S. Government Accountability Office, Sept. 11 Health Effects in the Aftermath of the WTC Attacks;
- <u>WTC Health Registry NYC DOHMH, Vol 1, No. 1: Addressing the Health Impacts of</u> <u>9/11;</u>
- Addressing the Health Impacts of 9-11; Report and Recommendations to Mayor Michael Bloomberg;
- <u>U.S. Dept of Health and Human Services/CDC/NIOSH; First Periodic Review of</u> Scientific & Medical Evidence Related to Cancer for the WTC Health Program;
- U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Toxicological Effects of Fine Particulate Matter Derived from the Destruction of the World Trade Center (attached); and
- NYC DOHMH, et al, Final Report re: Potential Exposure to Settled Surface Dust (attached).

As I stated in my July 6, 2022 letter, I commend Congress for creating the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund (VCF), which provides compensation to those qualified who suffered injury or were killed as a result of September 11th or the debris removal efforts at Ground Zero. New York City has worked closely with the VCF to ensure that City employees and others who were present in the enumerated zones on September 11th, or the days that followed the horrible attack, have the documents necessary to qualify to receive the compensation they deserve. I have also seen the lifelong injuries and serious medical conditions that those who saved lives at Ground Zero developed, so I am extremely thankful to the New York City Congressional delegation for securing \$1 billion for the September 11th Health Program.

I commend Congress for extending the VCF filing deadline to October 1, 2090, thereby allowing many more victims to be compensated under a simplified claim filing system that does not require lawyers, lawsuits, or proof of causality. Given these benefits, it is no surprise that over 34,000 victims have been compensated by the VCF in the last decade.

Although far less frequent, individuals have on occasion in the last decade filed claims against New York City. As discussed at the July 15, 2022 meeting with Congressional staff, the legislation establishing the James Zadroga 9/11 Health and Compensation Act left New York City subject to up to \$350 million in liability as a result of litigation arising from the September 11th attacks. Accordingly, with the continued threat of litigation, New York City cannot produce documents without expensive and expansive legal review to identify privileged material and consider litigation risks. New York City must weigh the costs of such a review against the potential benefits, which are likely limited given the extensive reviews and reporting already available on the health effects of the September 11th attacks, as well as the ability of victims to file claims under the VCF until 2090 without proof of causality. However, given the public interest in the production of these documents, New York City is working to determine the estimated cost of such a legal review. We are happy to work with your offices to determine potential federal funding sources and any necessary federal legislation to make production of documents economically and legally feasible for the City of New York.

That said, my administration is committed to continuing to support the responders, survivors, victims, families, and all those affected by the September 11th attacks. We look forward to continued discussion with your offices.

Epin Adum

Eric Adams Mayor